Fraxinus ornus Prop Orn. Plants 2-7-13

Comments to the authors

I have written most of my comments of the manuscript and have scanned the pages and made a pdf file, which is attached.

The authors need to state the temperature of cold stratification. They need to provide data for fresh nontreated (control seeds; otherwise, they do not show that fresh seeds are dormant. They need to tone done the statement that seeds have deep physiological dormancy (PD). To show that seeds have deep PD, you need to show that seeds need a long dormancy breaking treatment, GA does not promote germination and excised embryos to not grow. The authors show that a long cold stratification treatment is needed, but they did not test GA or excise embryos. Interestingly, they talk about previously reported research in which excised embryos apparently grew well in tissue culture. The authors need to give the % viability of the seeds and tell the reader what % of the viable seeds germinated. They need a concluding paragraph.

Comments to Editor

I have written many suggestions for changes and these can be seen in the pdf file, including a modification of the title.

The authors need to state the temperature of cold stratification. They need to provide data for fresh nontreated (control seeds; otherwise, they do not show that fresh seeds are dormant. They need to tone done the statement that seeds have deep physiological dormancy (PD). To show that seeds have deep PD, you need to show that seeds need a long dormancy breaking treatment, GA does not promote germination and excised embryos to not grow. The authors show that a long cold stratification treatment is needed, but they did not test GA or excise embryos. Interestingly, they talk about previously reported research in which excised embryos apparently grew well in tissue culture. The authors need to give the % viability of the seeds and tell the reader what % of the viable seeds germinated. They need a concluding paragraph.

After major revision, the manuscript should be Ok for publication, but I suggest that it be reviewed again.